



Connecticut Freedom of Information Commission • 18-20 Trinity Street, Suite 100 • Hartford, CT 06106 Toll free (CT only): (866)374-3617 Tel: (860)566-5682 Fax: (860)566-6474 • www.state.ct.us/foi/• email: foi@po.state.ct.us

Thomas McDonnell, Complainant(s) against

It's Your Right to Know

Notice of Meeting

Docket #FIC 2013-586

Commissioner, State of Connecticut, Department of Emergency Services and Public Protection; and State of Connecticut, Department of Emergency Services and Public Protection,

Respondent(s)

September 22, 2016

#### Transmittal of Proposed Final Decision September 22, 2016

In accordance with Sections 4-179 and 4-183(h) of the Connecticut General Statutes, the Freedom of Information Commission hereby transmits to you the proposed finding and decision September 22, 2016 prepared by the hearing officer in the above-captioned matter.

This will notify you that the Commission will consider this matter for disposition at its meeting which will be held in the Freedom of Information Commission Hearing Room, 18-20 Trinity Street, lst floor, Hartford, Connecticut, at **2 p.m. on Thursday, October 13, 2016.** At that time and place you will be allowed to offer oral argument concerning this proposed finding and order. Oral argument shall be limited to ten (10) minutes. For good cause shown, however, the Commission may increase the period of time for argument. A request for additional time must be made in writing and should be filed with the Commission *on or before September 30, 2016.* Such request MUST BE (1) copied to all parties, or if the parties are represented, to such representatives, and (2) include a notation indicating such notice to all parties or their representatives.

Although a brief or memorandum of law is not required, if you decide to submit such a document, an <u>original and fourteen (14) copies</u> must be filed *on or before September 30, 2016.* PLEASE NOTE: Any correspondence, brief or memorandum directed to the Commissioners by any party or representative of any party MUST BE (1) copied to all parties, or if the parties are represented, to such representatives, (2) include a notation indicating such notice to all parties or their representatives and (3) be limited to argument. NO NEW EVIDENCE MAY BE SUBMITTED.

If you have already filed a brief or memorandum with the hearing officer and wish to have that document distributed to each member of the Commission, it is requested that <u>fourteen (14)</u> <u>copies</u> be filed *on or before September 30, 2016,* and that notice be given to all parties or if the parties are represented, to their representatives, that such previously filed document is being submitted to the Commissioners for review.

By Order of the Freedom of Information Commission

W. Paradis

Acting Clerk of the Commission

Notice to: Thomas McDonnell

Stephen R. Sarnoski, Esq.

2016-09-22/FIC# 2013-586/Trans/wrbp/LFS//VDH

# FREEDOM OF INFORMATION COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CONNECTICUT

In The Matter of a Complaint by

Proposed Report on Remand

Thomas J. McDonnell,

Complainant

against

Docket #FIC 2013-586

Commissioner, State of Connecticut, Department of Emergency Management and Public Protection; and State of Connecticut, Department of Emergency Management and Public Protection,

Respondents

September 22, 2016

The above-captioned matter was heard as a contested case on August 26, 2014, at which time the complainant and the respondents appeared, stipulated to certain facts and presented testimony, exhibits and argument on the complaint.

On September 25, 2014, the Commission adopted a final decision in this matter. Notice of such final decision was mailed to the parties on September 26, 2014. The respondents filed a timely appeal of the final decision with the Superior Court. By Order dated April 29, 2015, the Superior Court remanded the case to the Commission "for an in camera review to determine which, if any, of the records are subject to the state erasure statute (General Statutes §54-142a) and therefore not subject to public disclosure under the Freedom of Information Act." Commissioner, State of Connecticut, Department of Emergency Management and Public Protection et al. v. Freedom of Information Commission and Thomas J. McDonnell, CV14-6027085-S, Judicial District of New Britain (Schuman, J.).

After consideration of the entire record, the following facts are found and conclusions of law are reached:

- 1. The respondents are public agencies within the meaning of §1-200(1), G.S.
- 2. By letter dated and filed September 30, 2013, the complainant appealed to the Commission, alleging that the respondents violated the Freedom of Information ("FOI") Act by not complying with a final Commission decision reached in a previous complaint that the complainant filed against these respondents.
- 3. The Commission takes administrative notice of the Second Final Decision on Remand in Docket #FIC 2008-416; Thomas J. McDonnell v. Commissioner, State of

Connecticut, Department of Public Safety ("DPS") 1; and State of Connecticut, Department of Public Safety (July 10, 2013). In the final decision, the Commission ordered the respondents, inter alia, to conduct a diligent search for any records responsive to the complainant's request to which Connecticut's erasure statute, §54-142a, G.S., does not apply, and to promptly provide any such records to the complainant.

- 4. In the instant case, the complainant contends that the respondents failed to comply with the Commission's July 10, 2013 order, by failing to provide him with copies of responsive records to which §54-142a, G.S., does not apply.
  - 5. Section 1-200(5), G.S., defines "public records or files" as:

Any recorded data or information relating to the conduct of the public's business prepared, owned, used, received or retained by a public agency ... whether such data or information be handwritten, typed, tape-recorded, printed, photostated, photographed or recorded by any other method.

6. Section 1-210(a), G.S., provides in relevant part:

[e]xcept as otherwise provided by any federal law or state statute, all records maintained or kept on file by any public agency, whether or not such records are required by any law or by any rule or regulation, shall be public records and every person shall have the right . . . to receive a copy of such records in accordance with the provisions of section 1-212.

- 7. Section 1-212(a), G.S., provides in relevant part that "[a]ny person applying in writing shall receive, promptly upon request, a plain, facsimile, electronic or certified copy of any public record."
- 8. It is found that the requested records are public records within the meaning of §\$1-200(5) and 1-210(a), G.S.
  - 9. Section 52-142a, which is Connecticut's erasure statute, provides in relevant part:
    - (a) Whenever in any criminal case, on or after October 1, 1969, the accused, by a final judgment, is found not guilty of the charge or the charge is dismissed, all police and court records and records of any state's attorney pertaining to such charge shall be erased upon the expiration of the time to file a writ of error or take an appeal, if an appeal is not taken, or upon final determination of the appeal sustaining a finding of not guilty or a dismissal, if an appeal is taken....

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Department of Public Safety is now the Department of Emergency Services and Public Protection.

10. Section 54-142a(e), G.S., provides in relevant part:

...any law enforcement agency having information contained in such erased records shall not disclose to anyone, except the subject of the record ...information pertaining to any charge erased under any provision of this section....[Any] person charged with the retention and control of such records ... shall provide adequate security measures to safeguard against unauthorized access to or dissemination of such records or upon the request of the accused cause the actual physical destruction of such records...

11. It is found that on May 8, 2008, the complainant made a written request for:

"personal access to the case file and then personally selected copies of documents regarding the homicide of Barbara Gibbons on September 28, 1973 in the town of Canaan, Connecticut, case number B-73-1442-C."

- 12. The respondents denied the complainant's request and the complainant timely filed an appeal to the Commission. Such appeal was Docket #FIC2008-416 and heard as a contested case on October 14, 2008. The respondents claimed that §52-142a, G.S., prohibited disclosure of the entire case file requested by the complainant, with the exception of reports since 2000 concerning forensic testing of certain pieces of physical evidence.
- 13. On January 29, 2009, the Commission adopted a final decision in Docket #FIC2008-416. The Commission concluded that §52-142a, G.S., does not operate to erase all public records of the underlying crime, and that the statute does not apply to records that do not reference or identify Peter Reilly as the alleged perpetrator of the Gibbons homicide. The Commission ordered the respondents to provide all such records to the complainant.
- 14. The respondents appealed the final decision to the Superior Court on February 19, 2009. By order dated August 14, 2009, the Superior Court remanded this matter to the FOI Commission, for consideration of the issue of whether the subject of the records may waive the erasure act. On August 25, 2010, the Commission adopted a final decision on remand, which concluded that the erasure act's prohibition against disclosure may not be waived by the subject of the records, except in limited circumstances specified by statute that did not apply to the facts of this case. The Commission again concluded that the respondents violated the FOI Act by failing to provide all non-erased responsive records to the complainant.
- 15. The respondents again appealed to the Superior Court. The Commission takes administrative notice of all of the pleadings and rulings filed in the administrative appeal, captioned State of Connecticut, Department of Public Safety v. FOI Commission and Thomas McDonnell, Docket #CV09-4019898, Judicial District of New Britain (Cohn, J.).
- 16. On December 14, 2010, in response to a request by the Court, DPS submitted a general list of the contents of the records that it claims are erased. On January 28, 2011, again in

response to a request by the Court, DPS indicated that the case file requested by the complainant contained records that both pertained and did not pertain to Peter Reilly. DPS also claimed for the first time that certain of the records to which §54-142a did *not* apply were subject to other exemptions.

17. On May 27, 2011, the Court issued an Order, which stated:

To date, the court has ruled that the plaintiff, the department of public safety (DPS), is incorrect in its overly-broad interpretation of [the erasure statute], i.e., that any item in the DPS file labeled "Barbara Gibbons murder investigation" is exempt from disclosure under §54-142a due to the dismissal of the charges against Peter Reilly.

"The court has ruled that the correct interpretation of the statute is that adopted by the FOI Commission[.]" (Emphasis in original.)

- 18. To ensure that any redactions to be made by DPS followed the intent of the FOI Act, as articulated by the Order, the Court appointed Hon. George Levine, as special master, to review the files in the case, with the assistance of an index prepared by DPS.
- 19. Subsequently, on September 19, 2011, the Court gave permission for the attorneys for DPS and the Commission to assist the special master in his in camera review of the records.
- 20. On November 26, 2012, DPS moved to remand the matter to the FOI Commission. The complainant objected to the motion; the FOI Commission did not.
- 21. On January 3, 2013, the Court granted the motion for remand and issued a memorandum of decision, which referenced its previous ruling (the May 27, 2011 Order) in support of the Commission's decision (see paragraph 17, above), and again ruled in favor of the Commission. The Court concluded that records that do not reference or identify Reilly as the alleged perpetrator of the Gibbons homicide are not erased by operation of §54-142a, G.S. The Court noted, as described in paragraph 16, above, that DPS had recently acknowledged that the files contained some records that do not pertain to Reilly, and that DPS now claimed that some of those records were exempt for other reasons. The Court granted DPS's motion for remand to "consider the evidence in the record in light of the standard set forth by the court." (Internal quotation marks omitted.)
- 22. On July 10, 2013, the Commission issued its Second Final Decision on Remand in this matter. The Commission noted that the respondents conceded to the Superior Court that their file of responsive records contained certain records to which the erasure statute does not apply. The Commission also noted the complainant's suggestion of several categories of records to which §54-142a, G.S., would not apply, such as certain photographs, maps, charts, medical examiner reports in the custody of the respondents, and names of employees assigned to the investigation. Finally, the Commission cited case law on the application of §52-142a, G.S., to demonstrate that there are types of records to which the crasure act does not apply.

- 23. The Commission ordered the respondents to conduct a diligent search for records to which §54-142a, G.S., does not apply.
- 24. It is found that on September 11, 2013, the respondents provided approximately 800 pages of newspaper clippings to the complainant. It is found that the respondents also provided approximately 30 pages of records relating to efforts to review the Peter Reilly investigation files, in response to a part of the complainant's original request that is not at issue in this matter. It is found that the respondents provided no other records pursuant to the Commission's order in its Second Final Decision on Remand.
- 25. Also on September 11, 2013, the respondents withdrew their appeal to the Superior Court in this matter.
- 26. Shortly thereafter, on September 30, 2013, the complainant filed his appeal to the Commission alleging that the respondents failed to comply with the Commission's order.
- 27. The complainant claimed that newspaper clippings were not part of his request for the "case file ... regarding the homicide of Barbara Gibbons." It is found that such records are not responsive to the complainant's request.
- 28. The complainant contends that he has firsthand knowledge of the contents of the respondents' case file on the Gibbons homicide, because when he was Commanding Officer of the State Police Detective Division, he was ordered to re-investigate the case years after the incident. The complainant asserts, as he has several times over the long course of this case, that the case file contains information that does not reference or identify Peter Reilly as the perpetrator of the homicide, such as (but not limited to) photographs of the exterior of the house, photographs of the church across the street, sketch maps, photos of the victim's automobile, lists of names of investigators that worked on the case, local weather reports for the day of the crime, names of people who took polygraph tests, names of prosecutors and dates employed, statements of witnesses that do not contain reference to or identify Reilly, diagram of the crime scene, victim's death and birth certificates, photographs of crime scene evidence, and correspondence among state agencies.
  - 29. As referenced in paragraph 9, above, §54-142a provides in relevant part:
    - (a) Whenever in any criminal case ... the accused ... is found not guilty of the charge or the charge is dismissed, all police and court records and records of any state's attorney pertaining to such charge shall be erased.
    - (e)(3) Any person who shall have been the subject of such an erasure shall be deemed to have never been arrested within the meaning of the general statutes with respect to the proceedings so erased and may so swear under oath.

- 30. The respondents claim that §54-142a, G.S., applies to the entire case file concerning the homicide of Barbara Gibbons. In essence, they claim that the erasure statute operates "coverto-cover."
- 31. Courts have recognized that the purpose of the erasure statute is to change "the legal effect of an arrest at its source ... to minimize the stigma associated with an arrest, to the point of treating persons who qualified for erasure as if they had never been arrested as a matter of law...But there is no evidence in the text of the statute that the legislature sought to go any further than that ... to change history." (Emphasis in original.) Martin v. Hearst Corp., No. 3:12-cv-01023-MPS, 2013 BL 217721 (D. Conn., August 5, 2013).
- 32. "The erasure statute operates in the legal sphere, not the historical sphere. That is, the erasure statute is designed to return a person's criminal record to the status quo when that person is found not guilty ... The erasure statute does not, and could not, purport to wipe from the public record the fact that certain historical events have taken place. Only in a totalitarian system could law purport to have such a sweeping effect." (Internal quotation marks omitted; emphasis in original). Martin v. Hearst Corp., supra, quoting Martin v. Griffin, No. CV99-0586133S, 2000 WL 872464 (Conn. Super. Ct. June 13, 2000).
- 33. "The purpose of the Connecticut General Assembly in enacting this statute was to permit a person against whom criminal charges have been dropped to have the fact of his [or her] prosecution 'erased' from his [or her] record. In other words, the statute was intended to remove the stigma of arrest or other formal charges from those who were never found to have committed any crime." (Emphasis added.) Penfield v. Venuti, 93 F.R.D. 364 (D. Conn. 1981) (in related civil litigation plaintiff entitled to "[E]vidence that would have been available to him if defendant had not been arrested and prosecuted...evidence collected by police at time of incident presumably would have existed notwithstanding the criminal prosecution.").
- 34. See also <u>Sinisgalli v. O'Rourke</u>, No. CV10-6003848, 120511 CTSUP (Conn. Super. Ct., Judicial District of New Britain December 5, 2011) (sworn witness statements and police reports compiled as part of criminal investigation of death not erased with dismissal of criminal charges against defendant); <u>State v. West</u>, 192 Conn. 488, 496 (1984) (records containing no information concerning a person's arrest not erased).
- 35. Subsequent to the Commission's Final Decision in this matter, the Connecticut Supreme Court decided State v. Apt, 319 Conn. 494 (November 10, 2015), which sheds additional light on what constitutes an erased record within the meaning of §54-142a, G.S. Apt concerned the relationship between the erasure statute, §54-142a, G.S., and a sentencing enhancement statute, §53a-40b, G.S., which permits an enhancement where a person commits a crime while on bail after an arrest for a different crime. In Apt, the defendant was arrested for a crime, released on bail, and then while on bail, arrested for a second crime for which he was convicted. Prior to his conviction of the second crime, the charges against him for the first crime were dismissed. The defendant argued that because the charges from the first crime were erased (pursuant to the dismissal), the prosecution was unable to show, as a matter of law, that he was on pretrial release when he committed the second crime. The Court rejected the defendant's argument. Instead, the Court ruled that pursuant to §54-142a, G.S., the dismissal erased records

that revealed the fact of the defendant's arrest, and not the historical fact that the defendant was on pretrial release on a specific date. Evidence of such historical fact other than the erased court records could be used to establish the basis for the defendant's sentence enhancement, the Court concluded. <u>Id</u>, 523. <u>Apt</u> held that "[s]ections 54-142a and 54-142c do not establish a per se bar on the disclosure of information relating to a case for which the records have been erased." <u>Id</u>.

- 36. It is concluded that the respondents' claim, that §52-142a, G.S., operates "cover-to-cover" to erase the entire case file concerning the investigation of the homicide of Barbara Gibbons, is too broad and not in accordance with the language of the statute or court precedent.
- 37. It is concluded that the proper test for whether a record included in the case file is erased is whether the record reveals the fact of the arrest of and charges against Reilly for the homicide. In particular, it is concluded that §54-142a, G.S., erases only such records that expressly reference Reilly as an accused person, or that reveal his status as in custody, under arrest, or charged with the crime of homicide of Gibbons.
- 38. It is also concluded that all other records, which reveal the historical facts of the homicide investigation, and which do not reveal the arrest of Reilly or the subsequent charge of homicide, are not erased. In other words, it is concluded that the records of the investigation, even those that mention Reilly by name, are not erased unless they reveal that he was in custody, arrested, charged, or tried for the homicide of Barbara Gibbons.
- 39. The respondents also now claim generally that some of the records are subject to other exemptions from disclosure, although they failed to raise any such exemption at the first evidentiary hearing in 2007. "The burden of establishing the applicability of an exemption clearly rests upon the party claiming the exemption...This burden requires the claimant of the exemption to provide more than conclusory language, generalized allegations or mere arguments of counsel...Rather, a sufficiently detailed record must reflect the reasons why an exemption applies to the materials requested." (Citations omitted.) New Haven v. FOI Commission, 205 Conn. 767, 776 (1988).
- 40. It is found that the respondents provided no evidence as to the applicability of any other exemptions. It is concluded, therefore, that the respondents failed to prove that any of the other exemptions apply to the case file records.
- 41. As ordered by the Superior Court, the respondents submitted a copy of the entire case file concerning the investigation of the homicide of Barbara Gibbons for in camera inspection. Such records shall be herein be referenced as IC-2013-586-1 through IC-2013-586-15,697.

- 42. Upon careful inspection of all 15,697 pages of the in camera records, it is found that the records identified as redacted in the pages following this report are erased pursuant to §54-142a, G.S., and may not be disclosed.<sup>2</sup>
- 43. It is concluded that §54-142a, G.S., does not apply to the remainder of the records and it is concluded, therefore, that the respondents violated §§1-210(a) and 1-212(a), G.S., by failing to provided such records to the complainant.

The following order by the Commission is hereby recommended on the basis of the record concerning the above-captioned complaint:

- 1. Within eight weeks of the date of the final decision in this matter, the respondents shall provide a copy of all non-crased records to the complainant, as described in paragraph 43 of the findings, above, free of charge.
  - 2. Henceforth, the respondents shall strictly comply with §§1-210(a) and 1-212(a), G.S.

Lisa Fein Siegel as Hearing Officer

FIC2013-586/hor/lfs/0922/15

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> By direction of the Superior Court, the records are exempted by page, not by line or by word. A small number of pages are exempted because they are illegible due to handwriting and/or copying quality.

Docket #FIC 2013-586; Thomas J. McDonnell v. Commissioner, State of Connecticut,

Department of Emergency Management and Public Protection; and State of Connecticut,

Department of Emergency Management and Public Protection

## Records Subject to Erasure Pursuant to §54-142a, G.S.

#### BOX 1

IC-2013-586 (hereinafter "IC") -1 through IC-62:

Redact: 3, 6-10, 14, 20, 22, 42, 44, 45

## IC-63 through IC-248:

Redact: 65, 67, 73, 84, 87-95, 104-108, 113, 114, 118, 136-147, 150, 151, 155, 156, 157, 161, 165, 185, 188, 189, 190, 201, 206, 209, 210, 212, 218, 223, 224, 227, 231-234, 236, 238, 244, 247

#### IC-249 through IC-414:

Redact: 251, 252, 272, 273, 276-280, 283-293, 296-298, 301, 304, 308, 314-319, 321, 322, 324, 329, 332, 336, 345, 346, 358, 359-367, 374-376, 380, 387-389, 408, 411-414

#### IC-415 through IC-614:

Redact: 415-419, 421-423, 428, 438, 443-446, 449, 484, 485, 491, 513, 515, 517, 519, 536-540, 547, 549, 550, 551, 560, 564, 570, 574, 575-578, 598-600, 604, 605, 610

#### IC-615 through IC-823:

Redact: 638, 639, 664, 703, 705-710, 715-719, 725, 726, 743-745, 747, 748, 753-757, 763-767, 774-781, 783-788, 793-821

#### IC-824 through IC-1009:

Redact: 824, 825, 831, 834, 839, 841, 842, 849, 850, 857-860, 874-878, 882-884, 892-894, 896, 897, 902, 903, 911, 915-920, 926, 927, 929, 939-941, 942, 944, 964-968, 971, 979, 980, 981 lines 16-26, 988, 989, 993, 996, 1004

#### IC-1010 through IC-1215:

Redact: 1016-1024, 1034, 1036, 1045-1055, 1059, 1072-1097, 1108, 1109, 1111, 1116, 1120, 1121, 1123, 1124, 1138-1140, 1143, 1144, 1152, 1153, 1158, 1160-1165, 1166, 1171, 1178, 1187, 1188, 1190-1194, 1199, 1200, 1203, 1204, 1212-1215

#### IC-1216 through IC-1312:

Redact: 1216-1238, 1241, 1244, 1262, 1264, 1286, 1296, 1297, 1299, 1304, 1306-1312

## IC-1313 through IC-1347:

Redact: 1333, 1335, 1337, 1339-1341

#### IC-1348 through IC-1358:

No redactions

IC-1359 through IC-1369:

No redactions

IC-1370 through IC-1407: Redact: 1380, 1385, 1388

IC-1408 through IC-1424:

No redactions

IC-1428 through IC-1494:

Redact: All

IC-1495 through IC-1577:

Redact: 1497, 1499, 1505, 1510, 1515, 1517, 1518, 1520, 1522, 1523, 1524, 1527, 1528, 1530,

1532, 1541-1577

IC-1578 through IC-1580:

No redactions

IC-1581 through IC-1593:

Redact: All

IC-1594 through IC-1676:

Redact: 1614-1619, 1621-1623, 1631-1633, 1644-1676

IC-1677 through IC-1699:

No redactions

IC-1700 through IC-1744:

Redact: 1716-1719

IC-1745 through IC-1747:

Redact: all

IC-1748 through IC-1833:

No redactions

IC-1834 through IC-1839:

Redact: 1835-1839

IC-1840 through IC-1842:

No redactions

IC-1843 through IC-1846:

Redact: 1844-1846

IC-1847 through IC-1920:

Redact: 1850-1853, 1857, 1862-1920

IC-1921 through IC-1930

Redact: 1923-1930

IC-1931 through IC-1941:

Redact: All

## **BOX 2**

Redact File Caption 50

IC-1942 through IC-1975:

Redact: All

IC-1976 through IC-1990:

No redactions

IC-1991 through IC-2015:

Redact: 1991-1994

IC-2016 through IC-2047:

Redact: 2016, 2017, 2020-2043-2046

IC-2048 through IC-2052:

Redact: All

IC-2053 through IC-2056:

No redactions

IC-2057 through IC-2059:

Redact: ALL

IC-2060 through IC-2061:

No redactions

IC-2062 through IC-2132:

Redact: 2062-2123, 2127, 2128

IC-2133 through IC-2135:

Redact: All

IC-2136 through IC-2141:

Redact: 2140, 2141

IC-2142 through IC-2143:

No redactions

IC-2144 through IC-2158:

Redact: 2152, 2153

IC-2159 through IC-2215:

Redact: 2159-2198, 2200, 2202, 2203, 2206, 2211, 2214, 2215

IC-2216 through IC-2223:

No redactions

IC-2224 through IC-2236: Redact: 2225, 2226, 2231

IC-2237 through IC-2267:

Redact: 2237, 2239, 2244, 2256-2258, 2265, 2267

IC-2268 through IC-2289:

No redactions

IC-2290 through IC-2366:

Redact: 2317, 2329, 2350, 2365, 2366

IC-2367 through IC-2399:

Redact: All

IC-2400 through IC-2423:

Redact: 2414, 2418

IC-2424 through IC-2548:

Redact: 2445-2450, 2458-2471, 2537, 2538

IC-2549 through IC-2571:

Redact: 2557-2571

IC-2572 through IC-2647:

No redactions

IC-2648 through IC-2669:

Redact: 2650-2669

IC-2670 through IC-2676:

Redact: 2671-2676

IC-2677 through IC-2688:

No redactions

IC-2689 through IC-2719:

Redact: 2691, 2717

IC-2720 through IC-2773:

Redact: 2721, 2722, 2724, 2726-2729, 2734-2737, 2739, 2742-2770, 2772, 2773

IC-2774 through IC-2789:

No redactions

IC-2790 through IC-2793:

Redact: 2793

IC-2794 through IC-2901:

Redact: 2799-2803, 2848-2852, 2857, 2858, 2862, 2863, 2867, 2868, 2869, 2889, 2890

IC-2902 through IC-2931:

Redact: 2903-2931

IC-2932 through IC-2939:

Redact: 2932, 2933, 2935-2937

IC-2940 through IC-2945:

Redact: 2940-2942

IC-2946 through IC-2978:

Redact: All

IC-2979 through IC-2990:

Redact: 2979-2983

IC-2991 through IC-3006:

Redact: All

IC-3007 through IC-3037:

No redactions

IC-3038 through IC-3040:

Redact: 3039, 3040

#### BOX 3

Redact File Captions 55A, 56, 57, 60, 62, 64, 65, 69, 70, 72, 73A, 77, 82, 83, 88, 89

IC-3041 through IC-3048:

No redactions

IC-3049 through IC-3077:

Redact: 3054-3077

IC-3078 through IC-3297:

Redact: All

IC-3298 through IC-3302:

Redact: 3298-3301

IC-3303 through IC-3401:

Redact: 3303-3306, 3315, 3319, 3321-3324, 3326-3332, 3337, 3374-3378, 3384-3388, 3391,

3395

IC-3402 through IC-3405:

No redactions

IC-3406 through IC-3458:

Redact: 3406-3417, 3421, 3423, 3427, 3432, 3433, 3442

IC-3459 through IC-3496:

Redact: 3461, 3462, 3467, 3470, 3472-3476, 3482, 3490

IC-3497 through IC-3537:

Redact: 3497-3500, 3502, 3503, 3506-3537

IC-3538 through IC-3547:

No redactions

IC-3548 through IC-3564:

Redact: 3551-3559

IC-3565 through IC-3566:

Redact: All

IC-3567 through IC-3612:

Redact: 3601-3603, 3607, 3608, 3612

IC-3613 through IC-3616:

No redactions

IC-3617 through IC-3626:

Redact: 3623, 3626

IC-3627 through IC-3630:

Redact: 3629, 3630

IC-3631 through IC-3643:

No redactions

IC-3644 through IC-3650:

Redact: 3649, 3650

IC-3651 through IC-3817:

Redact: 3660

IC-3818 through 3819:

No redactions

IC-3820 through IC-3829:

Redact: All

IC-3830 through IC-3836:

Redact: 3830-3833

IC-3837:

No redactions

IC-3838 through IC-3931:

Redact: 3889

IC-3932 through IC-3938:

No redactions

IC-3939 through IC-3990:

Redact: All

IC-3991 through IC-3994:

No redactions

IC-3995 through IC-4050:

Redact: 3995, 3996, 3998-4001, 4009-4017, 4019-4025, 4030, 4032-4036, 4040

IC-4051 through IC-4067:

Redact: All

IC-4068 through IC-4090:

Redact: 4068, 4072-4080, 4085-4088

IC-4091 through IC-4110:

Redact: 4091-4100, 4107-4109

IC-4111 through 4138:

Redact: 4114, 4115, 4122, 4131, 4132, 4136

IC-4139 through IC-4147:

Redact: All

IC-4148 through IC-4169:

Redact: 4148, 4149, 4151-4169

IC-4170 through IC-4232:

Redact: All

IC-4233 through IC-4270:

Redact: 4233, 4234, 4257, 4259-4270

IC-4271 through IC-4273:

No redactions

IC-4274 through IC-4283:

Redact: 4274, 4279

IC-4284 through IC-4405:

Redact: All

IC-4406 through IC-4408:

No redactions

#### **BOX 4**

Redact File Captions 100, 100A, 100B, 100C, 102A, 102B, 103

IC-4409 through IC-4414:

No redactions

IC-4415 through IC-4427:

Redact: All

IC-4428 through IC-4472:

No redactions

IC-4473 through IC-4482:

Redact: 4474-4477

IC-4483 through IC-4486:

No redactions

IC-4487 through IC-4489:

Redact: All

IC-4490 through IC-4693:

Redact: 4490-4655, 4662, 4663, 4668-4693

IC-4694 through IC-4698:

No redactions

IC-4669 through IC-5603:

Redact: All

IC-5604 through IC-5641:

Redact: 5616-5622, 5640, 5641

IC-5642 through IC-5643:

No redactions

IC-5644 through IC-5679:

Redact: All

IC-5680 through IC-5682:

Redact: 5680, 5681

IC-5683 through IC-5742:

Redact: All

IC-5743 through IC-5781:

Redact: 5757-5781

IC-5782 through IC-5831:

No redactions

IC-5832 through IC-5971:

Redact: All

IC-5972 through IC-5973:

No redactions

IC-5974 through IC-6002:

Redact: 5979-5982, 5985, 5986

IC-6003 through IC-6008:

Redact: All

IC-6009 through IC-6132:

No redactions

IC-6033 through IC-6053:

Redact: 6033-6050

IC-6054 through IC-6057:

No redactions

IC-6058 through IC-6078: Redact: 6072, 6074-6078

IC-6079 through IC-6101:

No redactions

IC-6102 through IC-6119:

Redact: All

IC-6120 through IC-6128:

No redactions

IC-6129 through IC-6151:

Redact: 6137-6139, 6143, 6144, 6148-6151

IC-6152 through IC-6154:

Redact: All

IC-6155 through IC-6157:

No redactions

IC-6158 through IC-6177:

Redact: 6158-6163

IC-6178 through IC-6184:

Redact: 6180-6184

#### **BOX 5**

Redact File Captions 150, 151, 152

IC-6185 through IC-6372:

Redact: 6185, 6192-6360, 6363, 6372

IC-6373 through IC-6407:

Redact: 6376, 6387

IC-6408 through IC-6440: Redact: 6410-6425, 6440

IC-6441 through IC-6444:

Redact: 6441, 6442

IC-6445 through IC-6458:

Redact: 6445, 6446, 6448-6458

IC-6459 through IC-6529:

Redact: 6466, 6467, 6469, 6474-6486, 6488-6529

IC-6530 through IC-6589:

Redact: 6538, 6539, 6543-6589

IC-6590 through IC-6676:

Redact: 6601-6676

IC-6677 through IC-6706:

Redact: All

IC-6707 through IC-6856:

Redact: All

IC-6857 through IC-6864:

No redactions

IC-6865 through IC-6960:

Redact: 6865-6869, 6873-6958

IC-6961 through IC-6976:

Redact: 6961-6967, 6973-6976

IC-6977 through IC-6999:

Redact: 6977, 6978, 6980-6984, 6986, 6987, 6990, 6991, 6993, 6995-6998

IC-7000 through IC-7025:

Redact: All

IC-7026 through IC-7043:

No redactions

IC-7044 through IC-7066:

Redact: 7044, 7054, 7055, 7060

IC-7067:

No redactions

IC-7068 through IC-7078:

Redact: 7069, 7078

IC-7079 through IC-7081:

No redactions

IC-7082 through IC-7092:

Redact: All

IC-7093 through IC-7105:

Redact: 7097-7103

IC-7106 through IC-7182:

Redact: All

IC-7183 through IC-7184:

No redactions

IC-7185 through IC-7429:

Redact: 7185, 7186, 7194-7199, 7204, 7206, 7208, 7209, 7214, 7217-7220, 7222, 7224, 7226, 7228, 7230, 7232, 7234, 7236, 7239-7241, 7244-7257, 7270, 7271, 7276, 7277, 7282-7429

IC-7430 through IC-7466:

Redact: 7433-7437, 7439-7466

IC-7467 through IC-7475:

Redact: 7467, 7472

IC-7476 through IC-7523:

Redact: All

IC-7524 through IC-7529:

Redact: 7524, 7526-7529

IC-7530 through IC-7537:

Redact: All

IC-7538 through IC-7711:

Redact: All

IC-7712 through IC-7742:

Redact: 7714-7721, 7726-7732, 7742

IC-7743 through IC-7750:

No redactions

IC-7751 through IC-7755:

Redact: 7751

IC-7756 through IC-7778: Redact: 7759 through 7778

IC-7779 through IC-7803: Redact: 7783-7798, 7802

#### **BOX 6**

Redact File Captions 162A, 165A

IC-7804 through IC-7906:

Redact: 7813-7851, 7854, 7859-7863, 7866, 7869, 7879, 7902, 7903, 7905

IC-7907 through IC-8121:

Redact: 7915-7917, 7921-8035, 8039, 8046-8051, 8070, 8071, 8118-8120

IC-8122 through IC-8274:

No redactions

IC-8275 through IC-8330:

Redact: 8275-8329

IC-8331:

No redactions

IC-8332 through IC-8335:

Redact: 8332-8334

IC-8336 through IC-8368:

Redact: 8336-8346, 8358, 8361-8366

IC-8369- IC-8700:

Redact: all

IC-8701 through IC-8703:

No redactions

IC-8704 through IC-8717:

Redact: all

IC-8718 through IC-8820:

Redact: 8718, 8719, 8790, 8791, 8792

IC-8821 through IC-8823:

No redactions

IC-8824 through IC-8945:

Redact: all

IC-8946:

No redactions

IC-8947 through IC-9044:

Redact: all

IC-9045 through IC-9280:

Redact: 9045-9162, 9165, 9166, 9169-9188, 9191-9195, 9226-9253, 9264, 9267-9270, 9273,

9275-9280

IC-9281 through IC-9288:

No redactions

IC-9289 through IC-9311:

Redact: 9289-9300

IC-9312 through IC-9406:

Redact: 9315-9401

IC-9407 through IC-9474:

Redact: all

IC-9475 through IC-9481:

No redactions

IC-9482 through IC-9490:

Redact: 9487-9490

IC-9491 through IC-9522:

Redact: 9498 -9510

IC-9523 through IC-9529:

No redactions

IC-9530 through IC-9551:

Redact: all

IC-9552 through IC-9576: Redact: 9558, 9560-9565

IC-9577 through IC-9592:

Redact: 9579-9592

## **BOX 7**

Redact File Captions 196A, 208A

IC-9593 through IC-9601:

No redactions

IC-9602 through IC-9690:

Redact: all

IC-9691 through IC-9965:

Redact: 9693-9697, 9700-9704, 9707-9964

IC-9966 through IC-9989: Redact: 9967, 9969-9989

IC-9990 through IC-10006:

Redact: 9993-10004

IC-10007 through IC-10011:

Redact: all

IC-10012 through IC-10039:

Redact: 10014, 10015, 10018, 10019, 10022-10024, 10036-10039

IC-10040 through IC-10055:

Redact: all

IC-10056 through IC-10166:

Redact: 10107-10111

IC-10167 through IC-10170:

No redactions

IC-10171 through IC-10181: Redact: 10171, 10174-10181

IC-10182 through IC-10218:

Redact: 10182-10198, 10201, 10215

IC-10219 through IC-10221:

No redactions

IC-10222 through IC-10324:

Redact: all

IC-10325 through IC-10335:

No redactions

IC-10336-10378:

Redact: all

IC-10379 through IC-10383:

No redactions

IC-10384 through IC-10387:

Redact: 10384, 10385

IC-10388 through IC-10416: Redact: 10391-10412, 10415

IC-10417 through IC-10442:

Redact: all

IC-10443 through IC-10460:

No redactions

IC-10461 through IC-10476:

Redact: 10461-10471

IC-10477 through IC10604:

Redact: 10477-10479, 10483-10487, 10492-10499, 10503-10506, 10510-10515, 10530, 10534-

10542, 10554, 10566, 10567, 10602-10604

IC-10605 through IC-10614:

No redactions

IC-10615 through IC-10618:

Redact: 10617, 10618

IC-10619 through IC-10684:

Redact: 10635-10637, 10648, 10649, 10652-10657, 10661-10672, 10674, 10681, 10682

IC-10685 through IC-10689:

IC-10690 through IC-10722:

Redact: 10690-10696, 10699-10722

IC-10723 through IC-10732:

Redact: 10723

IC-10733 through IC-10754:

Redact: 10746

IC-10755 through IC-10852:

Redact: all

IC-10853 through IC-10889:

No redactions

IC-10890 through IC-10935:

Redact: 10892-10897, 10909, 10912, 10913, 10916-10918, 10920, 10923, 10924, 10930

IC-10936 through IC-10937:

No redactions

IC-10938 through IC-10941:

Redact: all

IC-10942 through IC-10954: Redact: 10943-10948, 10951

#### BOX 8

Redact File Captions 209, 215-227

IC-10955 through IC-10956:

Redact: all

IC-10957 through IC-10960:

No redactions

IC-10961 through IC-11216:

Redact: 10961-10967, 10969, 10983, 10984, 11014, 11036, 11049, 11077-11089, 11095-11097, 11099, 11100-11104, 11118, 11119, 11131-11135, 11145-11147, 11150-11172, 11179, 11180, 11206

IC-11217 through IC-11220:

Redact: all

IC-11221 through IC-11231:

Redact: 11224

IC-11232 through IC-11236:

Redact: 11233

IC-11237 through IC-11609:

Redact: all

IC-11610 through IC-12074:

Redact: 11613, 11615, 11617, 11619, 11621, 11623, 11625, 11627, 11629, 11643, 11645, 11647, 11649, 11651, 11653, 11655, 11659, 11661, 11751, 11753, 11859-11892, 11895, 11902-11904, 11907, 11918-12074

IC-12075 through IC-12146:

Redact: 2078, 12080, 12081, 12082, 12084, 12086, 12088, 12090, 12092, 12094, 12096, 12098, 12100, 12102, 12105, 12107, 12113, 12115, 12117, 12119, 12121

#### BOX 9

Redact File labeled in part "12190-12215"

IC-12147 through IC-12188:

Redact: 12148, 12149, 12150, 12153-12157

IC-12189: No redactions

IC-12190 through IC-12215:

Redact: all

IC-12216 through IC-12304:

Redact: 12218, 12221, 12224, 12227, 12291, 12292, 12299, 12301-12303, 12305, 12306, 12309, 12316-12318, 12322-12324, 12326, 12328, 12329, 12335, 12361-12365, 12367, 12372, 12374, 12380, 12381, 12388, 12395, 12396, 12398, 12403, 12404, 12409-12411, 12420, 12422-12425, 12435-12443, 12453-12456, 12458, 12461, 12462, 12464, 12466, 12469, 12478-12484, 12488-12490

IC-12498 through IC-12583:

Redact: 12498, 12499, 12500-12502, 12517, 12532, 12537, 12538, 12552, 12555, 12570, 12571

IC-12584 through IC-12596:

Redact: 12589, 12592

IC-12597 through IC-12629:

Redact: 12597, 12602, 12607-12609, 12612-12616, 12625-12627

Docket #FIC 2013-586 Page 27

IC-12630 through IC-12730:

Redact: 12630-12641, 12650, 12651, 12669, 12671, 12673, 12675, 12678, 12686, 12704, 12705

IC-12731 through IC-12733:

Redact: all

IC-12734 through IC-12759: Redact: 12734, 12739, 12742

IC-12760 through IC-12855:

Redact: 12803, 12804, 12812-12815, 12823, 12824

IC-12856 through IC-12892:

Redact: 12856, 12859, 12861-12866, 12869-12872, 12874-12888, 12890-12892

IC-12893 through IC-12911:

Redact: 12894, 12895, 12897, 12898, 12901-12911

IC-12912 through IC-13028:

Redact: 12912-12914

IC-13029 through IC-13034:

Redact: all

IC-13035 through IC-13069:

Redact: 13051, 13052

IC-13070 through IC-13269:

Redact: 13074, 13075, 13078-13084, 13090-13092, 13095, 13096, 13098, 13101, 13105, 13111-13118, 13121, 13132, 13148-13150, 13168, 13169, 13172-13178, 13181-13183, 13189, 13190, 13199, 13210, 13212-13215, 13220, 13223-13227, 13230, 13232, 13239, 13243-13245, 13253, 13254, 13261, 13264-13266

IC-13270 through IC-13510:

Redact: 13291, 13293, 13295, 13309-13311, 13343-13345, 13372, 13408, 13411-13423, 13426-13428, 13429, 13432-13435, 13446-13454

IC-13511 through IC-13566:

Redact: 13537, 13538, 13542, 13548, 13549, 13559, 13561, 13562, 13563

IC-13567 through IC-13577: Redact: 13569, 13572, 13575

IC-13578:

IC-13579 through IC-13595:

Redact: all

IC-13596 through IC-13633:

Redact: 13612, 13614-13617, 13622, 13624-13632

IC-13634 through IC-13695:

Redact: 13637-13640, 13667, 13668, 13691

IC-13696 through IC-13767:

Redact: 13699, 13723-13742, 13745, 13746, 13748-13752, 13760-13763

IC-13768 through IC-13771:

No redactions

IC-13772 through IC-13783:

Redact: all

IC-13784 through IC-13798:

Redact: 13795, 13796, 13798

IC-13799 through IC-13847:

Redact: 13825, 13826, 13829, 13835, 13836, 13841, 13846

IC-13848 through IC-13883:

Redact: 13848-13857

#### **BOX 10**

IC-13884:

No redactions

IC-13885 through IC-13916:

No redactions

IC-13917 through IC-13975:

No redactions

IC-13976 through IC-14020:

No redactions

IC-14021 through IC-14058:

Redact: No redactions

IC-14059 through IC-14090:

IC-14091 through IC-14109:

No redactions

IC-14108 through IC-14426:

No redactions

IC-14427 through IC-14480:

No redactions

## **BOX 11**

Redact File labeled in part "14901"

IC-14481 through IC-14581:

No redactions

IC-14582 through IC-14590:

Redact: all

IC-14591 through IC-14607:

No redactions

IC-14608 through IC-14612:

Redact: all

IC-14603 through IC-14618:

Redact: 14616-14618

IC-14619:

No redactions

IC-14620 through IC-14677:

Redact: 14645, 14649, 14654

IC-14678 through IC-14680:

Redact: 14678, 14679

IC-14681:

No redactions

IC-14682 through IC-14695:

Redact: 14683, 14684, 14691, 14692

IC-14696 through IC-14716:

IC-14717 through IC-14741:

Redact: 14721, 14727-14730, 14733-14738

IC-14742 through IC-14769:

No redactions

IC-14770 through IC-14772:

Redact: all

IC-14773:

No redactions

IC-14774 through IC-14805:

Redact: all

IC-14806 through IC-14900:

Redact: 14811-14813, 14826-14629, 14834, 14855

IC-14901 through IC-14906:

No redactions

IC-14907 through IC-14908:

Redact: 14907

IC-14909 through IC-14913:

No redactions

IC-14914 through IC-14976:

Redact: all

IC-14977 through IC-14998:

No redactions

IC-14999 through IC-15012:

Redact: all

IC-15013 through IC-15020:

Redact: all

IC-15021 through IC-15122:

No redactions

IC-15123 through IC-15135:

Redact: 15123-15125

# IC-15136 through IC-15261:

No redactions

IC-15262 through IC-15412:

Redact: 15267, 15268, 15377

IC-15413 through IC-15600:

No redactions

IC-15601 through IC-15697:

Redact: 15616-15660, 15686, 15691-15695

## **END**